Culture And Employees’ Voice: Do Cultures Matter?
Joo-Young Park
Ph.D. Candidate
School of Labor and Industrial Relations
Michigan State University

Hirschman’s exit-voice model (Hirshman, 1970) is a well-established structure for understanding how employees respond to a decline in satisfaction with their organizations. According to the model, employees can respond in three different ways: 1) exit (leaving or thinking about leaving an organization), 2) voice (any attempt at all to improve conditions such as appeal to a supervisor), and 3) loyalty (passively but optimistically waiting for conditions to improve). Later, Rusbult and colleagues (1982) added 4) ‘neglect’ (allowing conditions to deteriorate through reduced interest or effort, chronic lateness or absences, using company time for personal business, or increased error rate). Research generally supports the validity of Hirshman’s model. (Addison & Belfield, 2004; Batt, et al., 2002; Farrell & Rusbult, 1992; Keith Dowding et al., 2000; Lewin & Mitchell, 1992; Rusbult et al., 1988; Van Dyne, Ang, & Botero, 2003; Withey & Cooper, 1989).

Most of this work, however, has been done in so-called “Western countries,” such as the United States, which share certain values and assumptions associated with the employment relationship. For instance, in these countries, the calculative view of employment relations, derived from the neoclassical view of so-called “economic man,” assumes that attitudes and cost benefit calculation, rather than cultural norms, are the primary the determinants of an individual’s employment-related behaviors (Block, Berg, & Belman, 2006; Triandis, 1995). The employer-employee relationship is a business relationship and employee behaviors in the organization are determined by the individual’s calculus of the advantages or disadvantages the individual associates with a behavior (Allen, Miller, & Nath, 1988; Redding, Norman, & Schlander, 1994). It is questionable, however, whether this “economic” conception of employment in the western countries can be applied in the countries that do not share this view of employment, especially considering that there is a large volume of previous studies suggesting that various cultural dimensions influence work-related psychological and behavioral phenomena (Bontempo & Rivero, 1992; Markus & Kitayama, 1991; Suh, et al., 1998; Triandis, et al., 1995; Wagner, 1995; Wasti, 2003).

Thus, it is reasonable to believe that the exit-voice model may operate differently in Asian countries than in the developed countries of the west. Employment systems in certain Asian countries such as Korea, are heavily influenced by the Confucian principles of loyalty and hierarchical obligation (Kim & Park, 2003). There may be inconsistency between these Confucian principles and the principles of exit-voice-neglect. In these Confucian culture contexts, values such as respect for authority and elders, loyalty, and the importance of education and diligence, are aimed at maintaining social order and harmony. They also formulate certain values in employment relationships as well, such as strong emphasis on loyalty for the company, hard work, paternalistic industrial conditions, and complete subordination to supervisors. These are considered to be key values for fast economic growth in these countries (Kim & Park, 2003). Applying these Confucian contexts to the exit-voice model, exit and neglect may be seen as incompatible with loyalty, while voice may be seen as inconsistent with the obligation of subordination.
Unfortunately, there is very little comparative research that examines the cross-cultural generality of the features of voice and the role of cultural values in predicting voice behaviors in different cultural settings. For instance, Price and colleagues (2001) examined the relationship between the value of voice and the magnitude of voice, that is, voice which spans different phases of the decision-making process, with samples from U.K., Mexico, Netherlands, and the U.S. They found similar shapes across four countries: direct, monotonic, and nonlinear. They, however, used undergraduate students who are 21 years old or younger, rather than ‘real employees. Despite the fact that many of their subjects had some part-time work experience, it is questionable if they are exposed to real cultural context in their workplace, such as unionization or relationship with supervisors. Botero and Van Dyne (2009) examined the effects of Leader Member Exchange (LMX) and culture, defined as individual value orientation of ‘power distance (PD),’ which is belief about the extent to which differences in power and status (Hofstede, 1980) predictor of employees’ voice behavior in the U.S. and Colombia. In this study, Botero and Van Dyne that not all pattern of voice outcomes are similar in two countries: for instance, it showed that both in the U.S. and Colombia, LMX and PD predicted voice but, contrary to the findings in the U.S., in Colombia, the interaction between LMX and PD did not predict voice, implying possible new explanations for voice, especially in the different cultural settings. For future research, they suggested a comparative study using the Asian culture.

The only research on exit-voice using Asian countries, is Lee and Jablin’s study (1992) examining the generalizability of the theory of exit, voice, loyalty, and neglect, using samples from Korea, the US, and Japan. This study supported the applicability of the theory to Korean workers, demonstrating that, with respect to exit-voice, Korea and the U.S. are more similar than Korea and Japan. However, there are several limitations: like Price and his colleagues, their respondents were students staying in the U.S. who were not employed. Thus, it is possible that these respondents were not representative of Korean workers employed in Korean firms in Korea. These students may not be subject to their native culture. Given these gaps, the purpose of this paper is to develop a model to apply to the exit-voice framework to one workers in one Asian country, Korean workers in Korea. Specifically, this paper will examine the relationship between Confucian principles of employment and whether the exit-voice model can be applied in an employment system in a developed Asian country.

The proposed study will apply the cultural lens to examine the generality of Hirshman’s EVLN model, focusing on the effects of culture on the individual employees’ voice behaviors. It will: (1) explain the basics of Confucian systems of employment relations; (2) examine the assumptions behind the standard EVLN model; (3) and determine the extent to which the predictions in the EVLN model must be modified in a Confucian employment system. In doing so, it is expected that this study will provide a broad sense of employee voice reflecting real work settings and discover diverse implications of this complexity practically.
References


Do Older Workers Who Experience Age Discrimination Leave?: Self-Reported Age Discrimination and Turnover Intention
Amy Linden, PhD Student
Centre for Industrial Relations and Human Resources
University of Toronto
Toronto, ON

Keywords: age discrimination, turnover intention, employment and labour, elderly

Abstract

The ageing baby boomer population is expected to trigger a significant increase in the proportion of the retired population relative to the working age population in the near future in developed countries. It is expected that this burgeoning older population will give rise to significant pressures on the social support system. It is important to understand the reasons older workers exit the labour market so that policymakers can develop targeted social policies that facilitate their voluntary continuation in the labour force so as to lessen the expected load on the social support system.

Most of the empirical literature on discrimination focuses on gender and race based discrimination. There is gap in the empirical literature exploring age discrimination faced by Canadian workers.

The data are drawn from the public use microdata file of the Public Service Employee Survey, 2002, to examine the effect of perceived age discrimination on turnover intention. This survey questionnaire collected information on work environment, skills and career development, harassment and discrimination, service delivery and labour management relations. A unique feature of the data set is that respondents were asked about their experiences of age based discrimination in the workplace.

I estimate the association between self-reported age discrimination and turnover intention with a logistic regression model. I first develop a model using all workers from the sample to examine the effect of individual and job characteristics on perceived age discrimination. I find that respondents who self-report experiencing age discrimination have higher turnover intention than respondents who do not. The results suggest that voice institutions in the unionized work environment may not adequately handle age discrimination allegations or that employees may not exercise their voice for fear of reprisals. The results also suggest that firms are not presently targeting older workers for anti-discrimination policies or that such policies are not effective. I also find a significant u-shaped association between self-reported age discrimination and turnover intention by age cohort and the size of the association is particularly large for younger workers.
La voix et le silence comme moyen alternatif de revendication : Profil des employés et éléments déclencheurs

Marie-Eve Dufour, Ph.D, Université Laval, Marie-Eve.Dufour@fsa.ulaval.ca ; Tania Saba, Ph.D, Université de Montréal, tania.saba@umontreal.ca

Cadre théorique : Jusqu’à tout récemment, l’expression des employés a principalement été étudiée à travers les mécanismes organisationnels formels de communication, dont le plus répandu est sans doute la présence d’un syndicat (Benson & Brown, 2010). Or, la précarisation croissante des emplois est susceptible de diminuer l’accès des employés à ces mécanismes formels. Également, la complexité grandissante de l’environnement de travail actuel et les nouvelles formes d’organisation du travail confrontent les organisations à des demandes sans cesse croissantes en termes de processus d’information. La communication formelle ne suffisant désormais plus, l’expression volontaire des employés devient alors de plus en plus recherchée par les organisations (Tangirala & Ramanujam, 2008). Dans un tel contexte, comprendre les conditions susceptibles d’engendrer les comportements d’expression des employés, tels que la voix et le silence, représente un sujet d’un grand intérêt à la fois théorique et pragmatique qui demeure empiriquement peu étudié (Pinder & Harlos, 2001).

Issue des travaux de Hirschman (1970), la voix se définit comme n’importe qu’elle tentative d’un employé pour changer une situation négative plutôt que de la fuir (Hirschman, 1970; LePine & Van Dyne, 2001). En tant que comportement individuel, elle existe sous plusieurs formes (Van Dyne, Ang, & Botero, 2003). Ainsi, les employés peuvent se soumettre aux opinions prépondérantes en croyant ne pas être en mesure de changer les choses (voix d’acquiescement), ou s’exprimer sur le travail sans pour autant faire valoir leurs vraies opinions par peur (voix défensive). Il est également question d’un type de voix par lequel les employés peuvent s’exprimer sur le travail dans une optique de contribution productive (voix prosociale). L’expression des employés se manifeste également par le silence qui se définit comme le fait, pour l’employé, de cacher aux individus qui semblent en mesure de changer la situation, la véritable expression des évaluations comportementales, cognitives et/ou affectives des circonstances organisationnelles (Pinder & Harlos, 2001). Tout comme pour la voix, le silence existe sous différentes formes (Pinder & Harlos, 2001 ; Van Dyne et al., 2003). Les employés peuvent avoir ainsi tendance à ne pas s’exprimer sur le travail par désengagement et résignation, sans vouloir faire d’efforts pour changer une situation (silence d’acquiescement), ou encore pour se protéger des menaces externes (silence défensif). Également, ils peuvent ne pas s’exprimer intentionnellement sur le travail par souci d’aider ou de protéger les autres (silence prosocial).

Méthodologie : À l’aide du cadre théorique du contrat psychologique et de sa rupture, notre recherche vise à développer une meilleure compréhension des comportements de voix et de silence. Pour ce faire, elle s’intéresse d’abord à certaines caractéristiques individuelles susceptibles d’influencer ces comportements, notamment l’appartenance syndicale, le niveau de scolarité, le statut d’emploi, l’ancienneté dans l’organisation, l’âge et le genre. Elle vise également à analyser les conditions de travail qui, lorsque non respectées, ont une incidence sur
ces comportements. Les données ont été recueillies par un questionnaire administré en ligne, en 2009, via l’Observateur, auprès d’un échantillon de 270 employés. Les trois types de voix et de silence ont été mesurés à l’aide de l’échelle à 30 items de Van Dyne et al. (2003). En ce qui a trait aux conditions d’emploi, elles ont été mesurées à l’aide de vingt-cinq indicateurs issus des écrits antérieurs et regroupés en neuf dimensions, notamment la stabilité, l’équilibre travail-famille, le développement interne, l’atmosphère sociale, le contenu d’emploi, les récompenses financières, l’étroitesse, la performance dynamique et le développement externe. Les caractéristiques individuelles, telles que l’âge, l’ancienneté dans l’organisation, le genre, le niveau de scolarité, l’appartenance syndicale et le statut d’emploi ont été mesurées pour la plupart par des questions directes.

**Principales lignes analytiques:** Les résultats obtenus, qui seront présentés lors du congrès, s’attardent à expliquer parmi les déterminants individuels et les conditions d’emploi, ceux qui influencent les différentes formes d’expression des employés. Les résultats permettront l’identification des caractéristiques et des conditions de travail qui favorisent certaines formes de voix ou de silence, contribuant ainsi à une meilleure compréhension d’un phénomène important, mais peu étudié. Cette compréhension peut permettre la détection des problèmes liés au travail qui initient des comportements positifs ou négatifs de voix ou de silence. Les résultats pointeront des opportunités et des solutions, facilitant ainsi l’implantation des innovations organisationnelles qui sont généralement tributaires de la participation et de la communication des employés, susceptibles d’anticiper les situations problématiques et de désamorcer certaines difficultés.

**Références:**
Public Interest Legislation in Manitoba: Employee Reaction

Purpose

The purpose of this study is to do an attitudinal study of employees of the Manitoba Civil Service and public agencies in Manitoba. Manitoba has the Public Interest Disclosure (Whistle Blower) Act, our investigation is a review of the degree such protective legislation is regarded as such by each level of the civil service. Do employees at all levels view such protective legislations as protective, or is it just political window dressing to satisfy the public concerns about the government acting and being seen to be a reasonable employer?

Our study will investigate how the current legislation could be made more effective in the opinion of the citizens it covers. What are the grass-roots perceptions of the application of the current legislation and what could be the application of improved legislation? Would more effective conflict resolution organization processes are of assistance to ensure positive results oriented business activity within the public sector, reducing the need for whistle blowing activity? What is the view of the Ombudsman’s department of the application of the legislation? Is it too cumbersome, is it meeting the intent it was set out for?

The other aspect of the study is to utilize political theory as an evaluative tool concerning what role are whistle blowers allowed to play within the political system and why they are an important element of it. Is the whistle blower an invention of the myth of a civil sociopolitical system based on an ideology of fairness? As well as such questions as: is there a different degree of social and political compliance in Manitoba compared to other provinces? What is the degree of fear in employees working for a civil sector employer? What is the level of bullying and harassment? Are the policy makers stating that there is a level of tolerance of dysfunctional behaviour by not having stricter laws of compliance? The general jurisprudential rule of the whistle blower privilege was developed to protect citizens who assist in running of public sector organization and to encourage others to do the same. The question is to what degree is this occurring and why or why not?

The constant demand on sound effective service from government demands new and unmet needs of society which include more comprehensive information, understanding and accountability of government Ministries and agencies. For society to move toward a more sustainable collaborative processes are necessary--one which engages citizenry and encourages public sector employees to come from awarding effectiveness to assist in the betterment of the organization.
Methodology

The study would need at least 200 employees in three separate Ministries willing to cooperate in the study. There would also be focus groups and individual interviews of senior level staff. All information would be kept solely confidential in the highest order. The study would start in February 2010. All questions would be vetted off of both of your departments in January. But we from BU will be the researchers and manage all research activity. Owner of the data will have to be discussed between the parties.

Future

It is our plan to do this study regardless, your involvement and support would be essential to the success of the study.

Brief Conclusion

Faster and more effective transmission of new and existing knowledge to policy - and decision-makers, and better communication of this knowledge to the public, will all be required to meet the challenge of the public sector. The above mentioned initiative is an effort in accountability to move to such a participative transparent model/s of governing. It is our hope that we may work collectively with you in this most significant study.
Abstract

Psychological Contract Fulfillment and Intention to Remain in Organizations: A Meta-Analytic Investigation of their Intercorrelations

The contribution of psychological contract conceptualizations and their influence on employee attitudes and behaviours has become a concern for many organizations today. Numerous articles, books, chapters, and dissertations have been written on psychological contract fulfillment, and several conceptual reviews and empirical investigations have contributed substantially to our understanding of how these perceptions influence employee intention to remain. Research in these areas has increased our knowledge and helped to guide general management practice in improving employee exchange relationships.

Although narrative reviews may further our understanding of the processes linking psychological contract fulfillment and intention to remain, a quantitative review would augment our existing understanding, by improving our estimations of their relationship to each other. Such a review had not previously been conducted. As such, the first goal of this study was to use meta-analytic techniques to evaluate whether psychological contract fulfillment, as perceived by employees, is strongly and positively related to employee intention to remain. In addition, the paper assesses whether the type of instrument used to measure psychological contract fulfillment moderates the relationship between psychological contract fulfillment and intention to remain, such that the single-item measure is predicted to yield a much less positive relationship than the four-item measure.

A total of 22 studies were identified, collected and reviewed. Twelve of these studies (comprising 14 samples) contained data related to this meta-analysis. From the selected group of studies, the effect size between psychological contract fulfillment and intention to remain was 0.31. This positive, medium-sized meta-analytic effect size provided support for the positive relationship between psychological contract fulfillment and intention to remain. Meta-analytic results also provided strong evidence of the presence of moderator variables. Because of the small number of studies in this meta-analytic study, further subdivision of the studies is not feasible. Future analysis, however, can investigate age, gender, and tenure as possible moderator variables to help explain the heterogeneity in the effect sizes of prior studies.