Boreal Regions of Canada

The Forests as Timber Extraction

- Commodity based industrial activities and dependencies to external markets
- Multiplier effect critical to regional employment
- "Jobs versus Environment"
  - Uncertainty built into ecologically sustainable development policies
    - Firms' adjustment capacities to their individual circumstances
    - Flexibility to adapt unforeseen circumstances
    - Sensitivity to historical context
    - What is socially and politically palatable.

  McNeill and Williams. Ecological Economics 64 2007

- Alternatives...
Major Forest Management Regimes

1) Dominant
   ◆ Technical / Output – Institutional (exogenous)
   ◆ Timber Primacy versus Habitat Preservation

2) Compatible
   ◆ Technical / Output – Institutional (exogenous)
   ◆ Joint production / Multiple Uses

3) Co-management / Shared Production
   ◆ Institutional (endogenous)

4) Multiple Interest Forestry
   ◆ Institutional (endogenous)
Societal

• Changes in regimes reflect societal values
  • Perceptions of the values
    • Consumptive
    • Non-consumptive

• Managing for whom?

• Who gets the benefits – Who bears the costs?

• Who are the decision-makers and players?

• Ethical or instrumental motivation?
Origin of Forest Certification

- Environmental NGOs
- Forest degradation
  - Irresponsible logging
  - Government failures
- Refusal of trade associations to develop certification
  - Trade Barrier
  - WWF takes the lead
  - UNCED Rio 1992
    - Non binding Forest Principles
    - Paved the way for certification
  - FSC Toronto 1993
    - HCVF : High Conservation Value Forests
    - 10 principles - 56 criteria
New Market Approaches

- **Forest Certification**
  - To demonstrate compliance with desirable forest practices
  - FSC - initially for the tropics RIO 1992-1993
  - Competing systems: SFI (US) 1995, PEFC (Europe) 1998, CSA (Canada) 1996

- CSR: Dow Jones Sustainability Index (2006)

- Equator Principles (investment banks) 2006

- Non traditional instruments; tradable rights TDR, production of non timber forest products, ecotourism
  - Monetization of valuable biodiversity conservation benefits
  - Removing property rights from lands to retain their natural conditions

- Payment for environmental services (PES)

- Country of origin validation

- SFM C&I Sustainable forest management criteria and indicators Montréal Process 2003
Principle # 3
FSC

• « The legal and *customary* rights of indigenous people to *own, use and manage* their lands, territories and resources shall be recognised and respected »
Principle # 4
FSC

• Forest management operations shall maintain or enhance the long-term social and economic well being of forest workers and local communities
Principle #6
FSC

Forest management shall conserve biological diversity and its associated values, water resources, soils, and unique and fragile ecosystems and landscapes, and by so doing, maintain the ecological functions and integrity of the forest.
Philippe Couillard
Premier ministre du Québec
“On the side of the workers”

- « Si l'objectif de certains est de faire en sorte qu'il n'y ait pas d'exploitation forestière de la forêt boréale au Québec, ils peuvent oublier ça, il va y avoir de l'exploitation responsable, durable de la forêt boréale au Québec, prévient M. Couillard. Deuxièmement, si l'objectif est de protéger le caribou forestier en faisant disparaître des centaines d'emplois, ça n'arrivera pas. On trouvera un plan pour les caribous forestiers, dont 75% vivent au-dessus de la limite nordique des forêts. Il ne faut pas non plus dramatiser la situation et on ne le fera pas aux dépens des emplois. »
Radio-Canada 12 mars 2015
In response to the proposals of the Labor party national leader to legislate for the protection of 240,000 ha of high conservation value forests in Tasmania during the 2004 election in Australia.

“"To the timbers workers of Tasmania, I stand beside you to protect your jobs, your families and the communities that depend on you:
- Your jobs are not negotiable.
- The RFA (current arrangements for managing the forest) is not negotiable.
- A pulp mill is not negotiable.
- Our veneer plants are not negotiable.
- Support for planned new investments is not negotiable.
- The very future of the timber industry in Tasmania is not negotiable.”"
Philippe Couillard
Premier ministre du Québec
“On the side of the workers”

• «Je ne comprends pas pourquoi les députés péquistes de la région ne prennent pas d'engagement clair à ce sujet. Il y a 10 000 caribous forestiers, ce n'est pas vrai que les emplois vont en souffrir. Je ne sacrifierai pas une seule job dans la forêt pour les caribous». Le Quotidien, 9 Mars 2014

• « J'aimerais ça vous (Greenpeace) entendre parler du monde un peu, lance le premier ministre. Réalisez les impacts de vos actions sur les travailleurs et sur les familles, et proposez des solutions. La solution, ça ne peut pas être "ce n'est pas grave, ils se trouveront d'autres emplois". » Radio-Canada, 12 mars 2015
“sustainable and traditional governance will only be possible if the government recognises aboriginal rights” (Curran and M’Gonigle. Osgoode Hall Law J. 1999)

- Not a recognition that First Nations are able to manage forest lands as they wish – recognising a distinct paradigm from the mainstream forestry mgt. paradigm

- Partnerships model: contractors-coops-business arrangements – MOUs and protocols-joint ventures

- First Nations as “just another stakeholder”
  - Consultation: legitimation of govt. and industry practices or “contribution to a better understanding among stakeholders?”

- Ensuring Sustainability
  - Impact assessment regulations
  - Criteria and indicators – integrating views and knowledge of FN?
  - Certification- important to FN- Principle 3 of FSC
The standard will be of interest to applicants, certifiers, and other interested parties.

**For applicants** and potential applicants, the standard should be used to identify the expectations that its forest management system and practices will meet.

**Certifiers** are expected to use the standard as a basis upon which to assess the practices of applicants.

**For other interested parties** (e.g., forest users, non-government organizations, consumer groups), the Standard can be used to provide insight into the concept of a well-managed boreal forest and to understand the way in which management must be undertaken to qualify for FSC certification.
The three affected forests are Lac St-Jean and Mistassini-Péribonka in Quebec, and Black Spruce & Dog River in Ontario. The major non-conformances and non-compliances relate to indigenous Peoples’ rights, environmental impact, forest benefits, monitoring and assessment, and High Conservation Value forests.

FSC notes the stated commitment of Resolute Forest Products to regain certification of three Canadian certificates that were marked for suspension from January 1, 2014.
De certaines réactions de la presse écrite régionale à la suspension des certificats FSC – PF Résolu

- **La CSN appelle au dialogue.** Louis Tremblay, Le Quotidien 18 décembre 2014;

- **Québec cède sa souveraineté à FSC.** Louis Tremblay, Le Quotidien 9 janvier 2015;

- **Cloutier** (président du syndicat UNIFOR-FTQ de la papeterie de Dolbeau) **propose d’abandonner la norme FSC.** Le Quotidien, 22 janvier 2015;

- **Le pacte CSN Greenpeace.** Bertrand Tremblay, éditorialiste au Quotidien 16 mars 2015;

- **Gestion forestière : Résolu sommé (par FSC) d’arrêter ses attaques contre la certification.** Jean-François Bégin, La Presse 17 mars 2015;

- **FSC souhaite la bienvenue à UNIFOR en tant que membre.** FSC, 4 mai 2015
Conflict on value vs Conflict of interests

- Aboriginal: compromise is possible on interests but not on values

- Biodiversity: predominantly an issue on values, science and FSC principle

Economic interest:
Employment and future of communities vs perception of what is sustainability vs impact of certification on export markets

Politics:
Commitment and Short term gains